

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 04860 2015

# **ADVANCED CIVIL PROCEDURE**

## **CASES AND MATERIALS**

### **VOLUME II**

**John W. Morden**

**FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO  
2001**

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 21 2001

FACULTY OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

# **ADVANCED CIVIL PROCEDURE**

## **CASES AND MATERIALS**

### **VOLUME II**

**John W. Morden**

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO  
2001



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

The organization of the materials in this volume is based, to some extent, on the organization of materials for *Civil Procedure II* prepared by Professor Stephen Borins in consultation with Professors Gary Watson and Neil Williams in the 1970s at the Osgoode Hall Law School. Some of the materials in this earlier set have been incorporated into this volume, but the relevant statute law, rules, and case law have, of course, been brought up to date. This volume has been prepared with the assistance of Shahan Mirakian, a student at the Faculty of Law.



# ADVANCED CIVIL PROCEDURE

## VOLUME II

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

#### TRIALS

1.	INTRODUCTION	1
	[Overview of pre-trial and trial processes: class discussion. See, generally, <i>Courts of Justice Act</i> , R.S.O. 1990, c. C.43, s. 108 and the Rules of Civil Procedure (Ont.), Rules 24.1, 46-53 and 77.]	
	Burden of Proof	
	Sopinka, Houston and Sopinka, <i>The Trial of An Action</i> , 2 <sup>nd</sup> ed. (1998) at pp. 49-51	2
	The Law of Evidence	
	Friedenthal, Kane and Miller, <i>Civil Procedure</i> , 2 <sup>nd</sup> ed. (1993) at pp. 466-472	4
2.	THE MODE OF TRIAL – JUDGE OR JURY	11
(a)	<u>Historical</u>	11
	The origin of the jury system. Devlin, <i>Trial by Jury</i> (1956) at pp. 5-14	11
	Civil Cases – Use of the Jury. Cornish, <i>The Jury</i> (1968) at pp. 74-76, 210 and 227-28	14
	Abolition of Juries in Civil Cases: Report of Royal Commission – Inquiry into Civil Rights (1968) Vol. 2, at pp. 859-60	18
(b)	<u>Respective Functions of Judge and Jury</u>	20
	Friedenthal et al., <i>op cit.</i> , at pp. 477-482	20

(c)	<u>What Actions may be Tried by a Jury?</u>	26
	<i>Courts of Justice Act</i> , s. 108	26
	<i>Proceedings Against the Crown Act</i> , s. 11	26
	<i>Public Transportation Highway Improvement Act</i> , s. 33(9)	27
	<i>Toronto Star Ltd. v. Canadian Broadcasting Corporation</i> (1975), 11 O.R. (2d) 289 (H.C.)	28
(d)	<u>In What Cases Should Trial by Jury be Selected?</u>	31
	Sopinka et al., <i>op. at</i> pp. 6-10	31
	Cound, <i>Friedenthal and Miller, Civil Procedure – Cases         and Materials</i> , 2 <sup>nd</sup> ed. (1974) at pp. 781-783	36
(e)	<u>Picking a Jury</u>	39
	Sopinka et al., <i>op cit.</i> , at pp. 32-34	39
(f)	<u>Procedure for Selecting a Jury Trial and for Striking out Jury Notice before Trial</u>	42
	Rule 47	42
	<i>Constitution Insurance Co. of Canada v. Coombe</i> (1992), 14 C.P.C. (3d) 322 (Ont. Gen. Div.)	43
	<i>Gracey v. Thomson Newspaper Corp.</i> (1991), 4 O.R. (3d) 180 (Gen. Div.)	52
	<i>Dorland v. Apollo Leasing</i> (1981), 33 O.R. (2d) 183 (Div. Ct.), rev'd (1981), 36 O.R. 2 <sup>nd</sup> 16n C.A.	56
	<i>Iona v. Rooney</i> (1987), 25 C.P.C. (2d) 174 (Ont.H.C.)	64
	<i>Nardo v. Fluet</i> (1993), 13 O.R. (3d) 220 (Gen. Div.)	75
	<i>Soldwisch v. Toronto Western Hospital</i> (1983), 43 O.R. (2d) 449 (Div. Ct.)	81
	<i>Strojny v. Chan</i> (1988), 26 C.P.C. (2d) 38 (Ont.H.C.)	89
	<i>Martin v. Deutch</i> , [1943] O.R. 683 (C.A.)	93
3.	CONTROL OF THE JURY AT THE TRIAL LEVEL	102
(a)	<u>Dispensing with the Jury</u>	102
	<i>Ryan v. Whitton</i> , [1964] 1 O.R. 111 (C.A.)	102
	<i>Yachuk v. The Oliver Blais Company Limited et al.</i> , [1944] O.W.N. 412 (H.Ct.)	104
	<i>Cosford v. Cornwall</i> (1992), 9 O.R. (3d) 37 (C.A.)	107
	<i>Hellenius v. Lees</i> , [1971] 1 O.R. 273 (C.A.)	117
	<i>Hamstra (Guardian ad Litem of) v. British Columbia Rugby         Union</i> (1997), 145 D.L.R. (4 <sup>th</sup> ) 193 (S.C.C.)	
	Headnote only	121

(b)	<u>Non Suit</u>	123
	<i>McKenzie v. Bergin</i> , [1937] O.W.N. 200 (C.A.)	123
	<i>McCaskill v. Ford Motor Company of Canada Limited</i> (1955), 17 W.W.R. 239 (B.C.S.C.)	127
	<i>Ont. Motor Sales Ltd. v. Steeves</i> , [1959] O.W.N. 205 (C.A.)	133
	<i>McCarroll v. Powell</i> , [1955] 4 D.L.R. 631 (Ont.C.A.)	134
	<i>Hunt v. MacLeod Construction Co. Ltd.</i> (1958), 15 D.L.R. (2d) 529 (S.C.C.)	139
	<i>Everett v. Dakota Ojibway Tribal Council</i> (1990), 39 C.P.C. (2d) 529 (S.C.C.)	144
	<i>Bank of Montreal v. Horan</i> (1986), 54 O.R. (2d) 757 (H.Ct.)	145
	<i>Payne v. Harrison</i> , [1961] 2 Q.B. 403 (C.A.)	146
(c)	<u>The Jury's Verdict and the Judgment</u>	156
	Rules 52.08 and 52.09	156
	<i>Stirling v. Davis et al.</i> , [1950] O.W.N. 770 (C.A.)	157
	<i>Boutilier v. Traders General Insurance</i> (1968), 1 D.L.R. (3d) 379 (N.S.S.C.)	159
	<i>Gobbo v. Rockingham Hardware Ltd.</i> (1971), 24 D.L.R. (3d) 355 (N.S.S.C., A.D.)	167
	<i>Terkuc v. Herd</i> , [1958] O.R. 37 (C.A.), rev'd [1960] S.C.R. 602	176
	<i>Cameron v. Excelsior Life Insurance Co.</i> (1981), 19 C.P.C. 101 (S.C.C.)	193
	<i>Baboi v. Gregory</i> (1986), 56 O.R. (2d) 175 (Dist.Ct.)	204
	<i>Sharpe v. Kim</i> (1987), 67 Sask. 81 (Q.B.)	206
	<i>Loffredi v. Simonetti</i> (1988), 29 C.P.C. (2d) 10 (Dist.Ct.)	209
	R.E. Megarry, Q.C., <i>Miscellany-at-Law</i> (1955) at pp.157-58	214
	Federal Rules of Civil Procedure (U.S.), Rule 50	216

#### 4. THE COURSE OF THE TRIAL

(a)	<u>Rules 52, 53 and 1.08</u>	217
(b)	<u>The Role of Counsel: Professional Responsibility</u>	228
	Sopinka et al., <i>op cit.</i> , at pp. 73-113; 124-129	228
	The Rules of Professional Conduct, L.S.U.C., Rule 5 and Notes and Rule 10 and Notes	275

(c)	<u>Presenting Evidence at Trial – Devices to Facilitate or Supplant Testimony</u>	
(i)	Formal Admissions	290
	Rule 51	290
(ii)	Judicial Notice	292
	Sopinka et al., <i>op. cit.</i> , pp. 53-54	292
(iii)	Presumptions	294
	Sopinka et al., <i>op. cit.</i> , pp. 54-56	294
(iv)	Inspection and Taking a View	296
	Rule 52.05	296
	<i>Chambers v. Murphy</i> , [1953] O.W.N. 399 (C.A.)	297
	<i>Myers v. Government of Manitoba</i> (1960), 26 D.L.R. (2d) 550 (Man. C.A.)	299
(v)	Court-Appointed Experts	314
	Rule 52.03	314
	<i>Phillips v. Ford Motor Co. of Canada Ltd.</i> , [1971] 2 O.R. 637 (C.A.)	315
(vi)	Medical Reports	325
	<i>Evidence Act</i> , R.S.O. 1990, c. E.23, s. 50	325
	<i>Ferraro v. Lee</i> (1974), 2 O.R. (2d) 417 (C.A.)	326
(vii)	Examination for Discovery	330
	Rule 31.11	330
(viii)	Orders for Examinations Before Trial	331
	Rule 36	331
(ix)	Letters of Request	333
	Sopinka et al., <i>op. cit.</i> , at pp. 68-70	333
(x)	Affidavits	335
	Rule 52.03	335
(xi)	Evidence Given at Previous Proceedings	336
	Sopinka et al., <i>op. cit.</i> , at p. 71	336
	<u>Split Trial</u>	337
	<i>Elcano Acceptance Ltd. v. Richmond Richmond Stambler &amp; Mills</i> (1986), 55 O.R. (2d) 56 (C.A.)	337
	<i>Duffy v. Gillespie</i> (1997), 36 O.R. (3d) 443 (Div. Ct.)	340
	R.S.C. Ord. 33, rule 4	345
	<u>Failure to Testify</u>	346
	<i>Mudrazio v. Holjevac</i> , [1970] 1 O.R. 275 (H. Ct.)	346
	<i>Gibb v. Ellis</i> (1959), 17 D.L.R. (2d) 262 (B.C.S.C.)	350
	<u>Reply Evidence</u>	354
	<i>Allcock Laight 7 Westwood Ltd. v. Patten et al.</i> , [1967] 1 O.R. 18 (C.A.)	354

(d)	<u>The Conduct of the Trial Judge</u>	358
	<i>In re Enoch</i> , [1910] 1 K.B. 327 (C.A.)	358
	<i>Fowler v. Fowler</i> , [1949] O.W.N. 244 (C.A.)	369
	<i>Regina v. Cook</i> (1997), 146 D.L.R. (4 <sup>th</sup> ) 437 (S.C.C.)	370
	<i>Boran v. Wenger</i> , [1942] 2 D.L.R. 528 (Ont. C.A.)	372
	<i>Briscoe v. Briscoe</i> , [1968] P.501 (Div. Ct.)	373
	<i>Felker v. Felker</i> , [1946] O.W.N. 368 (C.A.)	377
	<i>Majcenic v. Natale</i> , [1968] 1 O.R. 189 (C.A.)	378
	<i>R. v. Pallett</i> , [1970] 3 C.C.C. 430 (Ont. C.A.)	384
	<i>Bell v. Smith</i> , [1968] S.C.R. 664	385
	<i>Sorger v. Bank of Nova Scotia</i> (1998), 39 O.R. (3d) 1 (C.A.)	389
(e)	<u>The Case Goes to the Jury</u>	
	(In the year 2001 pages 397-439 deleted.)	
(f)	<u>When is the Trial Over? <i>Functus Officio</i></u>	440
	<i>Widrig v. Strazer</i> , [1964] S.C.R. 376	440

